



Islamorada, Village of Islands

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING

April 16, 2025 - 10:00 AM
ADMINISTRATIVE CENTER AND PUBLIC SAFETY
HEADQUARTERS
86800 Overseas Highway
Islamorada, FL 33036

AGENDA

I. CALL TO ORDER / ROLL CALL

II. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

III. PUBLIC COMMENT

IV. NEW BUSINESS

This section also allows for commissioners to address new business that may not have been included on the agenda.

A. Approve Minutes from March 12 meeting

B. Acknowledge the appointment of Islamorada Village Council Member, Deb Gillis, as Village Council Liaison to the Historical Preservation Commission

V. OLD BUSINESS

A. Distribution of newly condensed "Most Endangered Potential Historic" lists.

B. Plaque design update

VI. REPORTS, PRESENTATIONS AND ANNOUNCEMENTS

A. Check in with Commission Member, Jerry O'Cathey, who volunteered to review old HPC records in search of pertinent information for current HPC members

VII. ADJOURNMENT

A. Discuss tentative next meeting date

ADA Assistance:

These meetings are open to the public. In accordance with the Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990, all persons who are disabled and who need special accommodations to participate in this meeting because of that disability should contact the ADA Coordinator at (305) 664-6448 or by email at ADA@islamorada.fl.us at least 48 hours before the scheduled meeting



Islamorada, Village of Islands

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING

March 12, 2025 - 10:00 AM
ADMINISTRATIVE CENTER AND PUBLIC SAFETY
HEADQUARTERS
86800 Overseas Highway
Islamorada, FL 33036

MINUTES

I. CALL TO ORDER / ROLL CALL

Historic Preservation Commission Chair, Barbara Edgar, called the meeting to order at 10:05 am.

Absent: Megan Scallan, Commission Member (not excused)
Roland Moore (excused)

Present: Jerry O'Cathey, Commission Member
Emily Hernandez, HPC Liaison/Planner
Barbara Edgar, Commission Chair
Cinnamon Edgar, Guest
Tammie Gurgiolo, Commission Vice Chair
Kim Harrington, HPC Recording Secretary/Planning Coordinator

II. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Members in attendance participated in the Pledge of Allegiance.

III. PUBLIC COMMENT

This is a general comment section. It provides an opportunity for the public or commission members to speak about matters that are pertinent but not scheduled elsewhere on the agenda. The Chair will ask if anyone has comments.

None.

IV. NEW BUSINESS

- A. Approve Minutes from February 12 meeting
Vice Chair, Tammie Gurgiolo, motioned to approve the minutes from the February meeting. Chair, Barbara Edgar, seconded the motion and the motion passed unopposed.

V. OLD BUSINESS

- A. Commission members with updates to their "Most Endangered Potential Historic" lists will hand them over today to the Recording Secretary for updates to be completed for the April (or next) meeting.

Commissioners in attendance discussed the final properties to be removed from the "Most Endangered Potentially Historic" list and turned in a mastersheet to Recording Secretary, Kim Harrington, who will remove the selected properties from the electronic copy and re-print the new shorter list for the next meeting.

B. Plaque design update

It was determined that the electronic copy of the plaque design artwork is not on Anita's computer as was thought. Barbara Edgar said that the Village Staff designed it and that it came from the Village, so it must be somewhere at the Village. Kim Harrington, Recording Secretary, said that she will do a complete Village Computer System search for it.

VI. ADJOURNMENT

Barbara Edgar motioned to adjourn at 11:07 am. Tammie Gurgiolo, Vice Chair, seconded the motion and the motion passed unopposed.

A. Selection of next meeting date

It was decided that April 9, 2025, would be the tentative date for the next meeting of the HPC, and that Recording Secretary, Kim Harrington, would send out an email to HPC members to ensure that a quorum is available for that date first, then confirm.

Kim Harrington, Recording Secretary DATE

Barbara Edgar, Chair DATE

Rank	Name	Location	Status	AK#	FMSF#	Local Criteria				National Criteria			
						Significant events	Significant people	Architectural value	Archaeological	Significant events	Significant people	Architectural value	Archaeological
1	All "Hurricane Houses"	88741 Old Hwy	Unprotected (New Deal Resource)	1516953	MO04148	X		X		X		X	
	(22 buildings)	46 Schooner Bay Dr	Unprotected (New Deal Resource)	1517160	MO04151	X		X		X		X	
		88761 Overseas Hwy	Unprotected (New Deal Resource)	1517135	MO04152	X		X		X		X	
		88785 Overseas Hwy	Unprotected (New Deal Resource)	1516902	MO04164	X		X		X		X	
		86801 Old Hwy	Unprotected (New Deal Resource)	1108472	MO04223	X		X		X		X	
		83271 Old Hwy	Unprotected (New Deal Resource)	1496464	MO04266	X		X		X		X	
		83257 Old Hwy	Unprotected (New Deal Resource)	1496499	MO04267	X		X		X		X	
		83251 Old Hwy	Unprotected (New Deal Resource)	1496502	MO04268	X		X		X		X	
		83249 Old Hwy	Unprotected (New Deal Resource)	1496511	MO04269	X		X		X		X	
		81155 Old Hwy	Unprotected (New Deal Resource)	1111341	MO04387	X		X		X		X	
		81120 Old Hwy	Unprotected (New Deal Resource)	1497061	MO04388	X		X		X		X	
		81212 Old Hwy	Unprotected (New Deal Resource)	1497002	MO04389	X		X		X		X	
		81220 Old Hwy	Unprotected (New Deal Resource)	1497037	MO04390	X		X		X		X	
		213 Palm Ave	Unprotected (New Deal Resource)	1491063	MO04393	X		X		X		X	
		144 Industrial Rd	Unprotected (New Deal Resource)	1110663	MO04407	X		X		X		X	
		100 Beach Rd	Unprotected (New Deal Resource)	1494194	MO04408	X		X		X		X	
		Preston St (Moorings)	Unprotected (New Deal Resource)	1494208	MO04409	X		X		X		X	
		112 Beach Rd	Unprotected (New Deal Resource)	1494160	MO04410	X		X		X		X	
		108 Beach Rd	Unprotected (New Deal Resource)	1494178	MO04411	X		X		X		X	
		109 Beach Rd	Unprotected (New Deal Resource)	1494011	MO04414	X		X		X		X	
		Beach Rd (Moorings)	Unprotected (New Deal Resource)	1494208	MO04416	X		X		X		X	
		81651 Old Hwy	Unprotected (New Deal Resource)	1493970	MO04423	X		X		X		X	
2	Krome house	2 De Leon Ave	Unprotected	1494577	MO04317	X	X	X		X	X	X	
3	Helen Wadley Library	81850 Overseas Hwy	Unprotected (New Deal Resource)	1110345	MO04370	X		X		X		X	
4	McKee's Museum of Sunken Treasure "castle" building	86729 Old Hwy	Unprotected	8743785	MO04235		X	X				X	
5	Key Lime building	MM 86.5 Overseas Hwy	Unprotected	1106151	MO03976	X	X						
6	First Baptist Church (relocated wooden Matecumbe Methodist bldg)	81200 Overseas Hwy	Unprotected	1110949	not surveyed	X							
7	Toll Gate Inn/Boy Scout Seabase (multiple bldgs)	73800 Overseas Hwy	Unprotected	1114243	MO04482	X		X		X		X	
8	Uncle's Restaurant building	80900 Overseas Hwy	Unprotected	1111899	not surveyed								
9	Midway Café building	80000 Overseas Hwy	Unprotected	8776896	MO04483	X		X		X		X	
10	Albury House/Kaiyo	81701 Old Hwy	Unprotected	1493937	MO04421	X	X	X		X		X	
11	Station agent's house next door to Krome house (location? Leo Johnson house? Built by P. L. Wilson, railroad construction engineer?)	De Leon Ave	Unprotected	1494577		X	X	X		X	X	X	
12	The Moorings	Palm Ave	Unprotected	1110825	MO04396	X		X					
		153 S Hammock Rd	Unprotected	1495611	MO04265			X				X	
13	La Jolla Resort	82216 Overseas Hwy	Unprotected	1492094	MO04329	X		X		X		X	
14	La Siesta Resort (Caribbee Colony)	80241 Overseas Hwy	Unprotected	1112186	MO04426								
15	Island Villa, historic Overseas Inn, Matecumbe School, Sweeting	81681 Old Hwy	Unprotected (New Deal Resource)	1493953	MO04422	X	X	X		X		X	
16A	Russell Family Cemetery	83271 Overseas Hwy	Unprotected (private easement)	1496464	MO04503		X		X		X		X
16B	Pinder Cemetery	Cheeca Lodge	Unprotected	1110337	not surveyed	X	X		X	X	X		X
17	Clifton-Russell house (at Green Turtle Hammock Preserve)	MM 81 Overseas Hwy	Unprotected	1111376	MO04377		X	X			X	X	
18	Post Office ruins (on Centennial Bank property)	82787 Overseas Hwy	Unprotected	1496006	MO04504	X			X	X			X
19	Cisterns (native middens) near Island Christian School	83400 Overseas Hwy	Unprotected	1109509	8MO00018				X				X
20A	Cistern north (near the Islander Resort)	N Carroll St	Unprotected	1493163	8MO02094	X			X	X			X
20B	Cistern south (near the Islander Resort)	N Carroll St	Unprotected	1493171	8MO02094	X			X	X			X
21	Ma's Fish Camp (Hotel Matecumbe)	105 Palm Ave	Unprotected	1491144	MO04406								
22	Robbie's Marina (Starck's Fish Camp)	77522 Overseas Hwy	Unprotected	1113794	MO04437	X	X	X		X	X	X	
23	Ted Williams house	140 Madiera Rd	Unprotected	1491888	MO04290		X	X			X		